MINUTES OF 12th MEETING OF THE REVIEW COMMITTEE TO REVIEW THE PRIVATE FOREST AREAS IDENTIFIED BY STATE LEVEL EXPERT COMMITTEE (THOMAS AND ARAUJO COMMITTEE) ON PRIVATE FOREST HELD ON 17.08.2021.

A meeting of the Review Committee was held on 17/08/2021 at 3.30 pm in the Conference hall of the Forest Department, Goa Van Bhavan, Altinho, Panaji under the Chairmanship of Chief Conservator of Forests.

Following members attended the meeting:

1	Mr. Surendra Naik,	Member
	Additional Collector, (Revenue), South Goa District	*
2	Mr. Pradeep Malik,	Member
2	Representative of the Director of Agriculture.	Mamban
3	Mr. Anant G. Samant, Asst. Conservator of Forests Headquarters, North Goa Division.	Member
4	Mr. Minguel Fernandes, Asst. Conservator of Forests, Headquarter, South Goa Division.	Member
5	Mr. Yeshwant Bicholkar, Representative of Director of Settlement and Land Records, Panaji Goa.	Member
6	Mr. Dilesh A. Gauns Desai-Chief Forest Surveyor Working Plan Division, Panaji	Spl Invitee
7	Mr. Anisha Kalkoor M., IFS Dy. Conservator of Forests, Working Plan Division, Panaji.	Member Secretary

At the outset the Member Secretary welcomed all the members of the Committee and informed about the action taken on decision of the previous meeting of the Review Committee held on 10/06/2021. Member Secretary informed that the first interim report of the Review Committee disposing 858 Survey Numbers and the 2nd interim report of the Review Committee disposing of 378 Survey Numbers was submitted to the Government for approval vide note dated 26.04.2021 and note dated 01.07.2021. Approval of the Govt is awaited. It was also informed that the minutes of the 11th meeting has been officially communicated to all the members and no comment received from any member.

AGF (N) ACF(S) AC

AC (S)

DIR (AGR

Thereafter agenda-wise discussion was held. Following were discussed /decided

Agenda item no 12.1 Review of progress of ongoing field verification & survey of Private Forest.

As per the status update received by Dy. Conservator of Forests (North) and Dy. Conservator of Forests (South), the progress in field verification & survey of Private Forest as on 17.08.2021 is given below:

Particulars	North Goa	South Goa	Total
Area enumerated (in Ha)	1831 ha	3390 ha	5221ha
Area qualified(in Ha)	558.66 ha*	838.00 ha*	1396.66 ha*
Area for which Plan prepared (in	347.22ha*	117.00 ha*	464.22a*
Ha)		3 114	

^{*}Final status to be determined after hearing of the objectors/representations and total enumeration, if required.

- 12.1.1 ACF (HQ) of both the territorial divisions expressed the following difficulties faced in the field for survey works which affected the progress of work. Due to the rains, field survey and enumeration works have ceased. Even on rain free days, it is difficult to approach the sites due to undergrowth and there are chances of instruments getting damaged if the rains suddenly come. However, they informed the committee that the work of preparation of enumeration reports and plan preparation works are going on, which will be submitted.
 - a. DCF (North/South) are directed to submit the reports of field verification and the plans prepared by the sub committees immediately for further action on the matter.
 - b. They were asked to be in readiness and restart survey and enumeration work as soon as conditions are conducive for the same.
 - c. Further, the preparation of maps for the areas which are qualifying after field verification shall be completed immediately and submitted for further action on the matter. Besides the subcommittee members, DCF (North)/ (South) should also sign the plans before forwarding.

(Action: DCF (North)/DCF (South)/RFOs and MS of Sub-committees)

12.1.2 The Member Secretary pointed out that a large number of reports are found incomplete during scrutiny w.r.to signature of sub-committee members and it has to be sent back to DCFs/ Sub-committees for necessary action. Further, there are other errors e.g. all sample points not enumerated, mismatch between area qualifying and plan prepared, because of which reports have to be sent back.

ACF (N) ACF(S) AC (N)

AC (S)

IR (DSLR) DIR (AGRI

As this is leading to delay in review exercise, DCF (North/South) are directed to ensure that all the field reports are properly prepared and authenticated by members of the committee before sending it to the DCF (Working Plan).

(Action: DCF (North)/DCF (South))

12.1.3 The Chief Forest Surveyor informed that there are 154 provisional Survey Nos. identified by the Thomas and Araujo committee which were excluded in the final report. Same has been digitised and work of analysis is going on as decided in the 10th Review Committee meeting. He was asked to complete the exercise at the earliest.

(Action: Chief Forest Surveyor)

Agenda item no 12.2: Review of area qualified as per field verification and after hearing of affected persons.

The Review committee discussed the decisions taken in the public hearings called vide notice no. MS/REV-PF/DVF/WP/2019-20/246 dated 23/06/2021 conducted on 30.06.2021 and decided the following:

Sr No	Village- Taluka	Survey Nos.	Area	Decision of the Review Committee
1.	Verna of Salcete Taluka	202	15.04 ha	As objections raised by owners, it was decided that the concerned Sub Committee will revisit Survey Number 202 of Verna Village of Salcete Taluka, along with objectors/ owners of areas provisionally identified as Private Forests and re-submit its report.
2.	Pilliem of Dharban dora Taluka	11	12.52 ha	
3.	Pilliem of Dharban dora Taluka	Dharban ora	5.02 Ha	An area of 5.02 ha. is qualified as Private Forest in Survey Number 7 of Village Pilliem of Dharbandora Taluka.
		15	17.21 Ha	An area of 17.21 ha. is qualified as Private Forest in Survey Number 15 of Village Pilliem of Dharbandora Taluka.

ACF (N) ACF(S) AC

AC (S)

DIR (DSLR) DIR (AGRI

16	19.36	Since there were no objections for
	Ha	Survey Number 16 of Village Pilliem
		of Dharbandora Taluka the committee finalized that area of 19.36 Ha as per plan prepared for
		the area qualified as private forest.

The Review committee discussed the decisions taken in the public hearing called vide notice no. MS/REV-PF/DVF/WP/2019-20/296 dated 08/07/2021 conducted on 15.07.2021 and decided the following:

Sr .N	Village- Taluka	Survey Nos.	Area	Decision of the Review Committee
1.	Sulcorna village of Quepem Taluka	19(p)	7.596 ha.	As objections raised by owners regarding sampling, it was decided that the concerned Sub Committee will revisit in Survey Number 19(p) of Sulcorna village of Quepem Taluka along with objectors/owners of areas provisionally identified as Private Forests and re-submit its report after 100% enumeration.
2.	Sulcorna village of Quepem Taluka	38(P)	14.92 Ha.	As objections raised by owners regarding sampling, it was decided that the concerned Sub Committee will revisit Survey Number 38(P) of Sulcorna village of Quepem Taluka along with objectors/owners of areas provisionally identified as Private Forests and re-submit its report after 100% enumeration.
3.	Sulcorna village of Quepem Taluka	29(P)	7.29 Ha.	An area of 7.29 Ha. is qualified as Private Forest in Survey Number 29(P) of Sulcorna village of Quepem Taluka.
4.	Sulcorna village of Quepem Taluka	18(P)	14.34 12 Ha.	An area of 14.3412 Ha. is qualified as Private Forest in Survey Number 18(P) of Sulcorna village of Quepem Taluka.
5.	Sulcorna village of Quepem Taluka	21(P)	3.61 Ha.	An area of 3.61 Ha. is qualified as Private Forest in Survey Number 21(P) of Sulcorna village of Quepem Taluka.
6.	Sulcorna village of Quepem Taluka	36(P)	4.063 4 Ha.	An area of 4.0634 Ha. is qualified as Private Forest in Survey Number 36(P) of Sulcorna village of Quepem Taluka.
7.	Sulcorna village of	37(P)	2.203 7Ha.	An area of 2.2037Ha. is qualified as Private Forest in Survey Number 37(P) of Sulcorna village of Quepem Taluka.

AC (N) AC (S) DIR DER

	Quepem Taluka			
8.	Sulcorna village of Quepem Taluka	40(P)	3.84 Ha	Since there were no objections for Survey Number 40(P) of Village Sulcorna of Quepem Taluka the committee finalized that area of 3.84 Ha as per plan prepared for the area qualified as private forest.

Agenda item no 12.3: Review of non-qualifying areas and remaining portion of repeated and adjoining survey numbers, etc.

Review of survey numbers found non-qualifying areas after field verification.

- The field reports submitted by Sub-Committees after ground I. verification were placed before the Review Committee and after detailed analysis based on LISS IV FCM 2014-15 (FSI), analysis through Google Timeline change corroborated by LISS III FCM 2012-13, Division offence case, Tree Felling, FCA & Court order etc if any, the review Committee found additional Survey Numbers which are not qualified for all three criteria after evaluation, deliberations and discussion on each reports, the decision of the committee on 70 Survey Numbers is enclosed herewith (Annexure-I).
- The Member Secretary invited the attention of the committee members II. that as per the patches provided by the Forest Survey of India, there are large green areas of more than 5 ha and more than 40 percent canopy density found outside the survey numbers provisionally identified by Thomas and Araujo committees. However, the review committee is reviewing only the areas provisionally identified by the Thomas and Araujo committees as per the mandate given to the committee. It is also noticed that in some cases, the patch extends to the areas adjacent to the survey numbers which are not identified by Thomas and Araujo committees and the review can only be completed if the entire patch is verified in the field. The example of two survey numbers namely Sy No. 357 and 364 of Velim village in Salcete were shown to the committee. The committee observed that its mandate is to review only the areas identified by the Thomas and Araujo committees but this issue may be brought to the notice of the Government.

Agenda item 12.4: Any other matter with the permission of Chair

The Committee noted that out of three criteria of Private Forests, 12.4.1 two criteria i.e the criteria of area and canopy is determined through the FCM provided by FSI which is already received and final. Hence, it is the third criteria of species composition being determined through enumeration done by sub-committees under direct supervision of concerned DCF, which is determining the status of Private Forest of a Survey number. Hence, it was thought essential to put additional safeguards and monitoring mechanisms regarding enumeration. Following were discussed and decided in the Review

Committee Meeting in this regard:

DIR DELR

- a. It was reiterated that the Range Forest Officer/Member Secretary of the Sub-Committee shall invariably visit all the sites and verify 100% sample points on the ground.
- b. Further, ISLR & Talati who are also the members of the sub committees, shall also attend the field enumeration as per convenience and verify the report prepared by the subcommittee before sending it to the review committee.
- c. In the pattern of South Forest Division, ACFs may be assigned Range/area for checking enumeration. Concerned ACF must check at least 20% sample points of each sheet.
- d. The Deputy Conservator of Forests of both the divisions shall conduct regular and random test checks for verification of the reports submitted by the subcommittees. DCFs shall conduct at least 5 per cent random checking of the reports submitted by the sub committees and verify the reports before sending it to the review committee.
- e. Additional points may be given to sub-committees for verification to avoid any ambiguity in field enumeration in case of
 - i. Forestry tree composition is reported to be between 60% -75 %.
 - ii. No. of trees in the sample plot is less than or equal to 15.
 - iii. There is uneven distribution of Forestry and Non-Forestry species with alternate sample plots qualifying and non-qualifying.
- f. Geo-reference photograph of the trees on sampling points shall mandatorily be taken along with representatives/objectors/ owners of the property as the case may be and submitted in a CD along with the enumeration report. The CD must be signed by the RFO and the DCF.
- g. For proper verification of field data received from sub committees through respective divisions, all the field reports shall be scrutinized by ACF Headquarters (North and South) for correctness and completeness before submitting the same to the review committee. ACF (Headquarters) of both the territorial divisions are directed to attend the office of DCF (Working Plan) twice in a week on every Tuesdays and Fridays in this regard.
- h. It was also decided that both the territorial divisions shall submit the detailed status report on total area enumerated in the field, extent of area qualified as private forest and area for which map prepared on weekly basis for regular monitoring of field verification exercise.

(Action: DCF (North)/ (South), RFOs and MS of Sub-committees)

12.4.2 It was also observed that considering the importance of enumeration exercise closer involvement of a DCF level officer is necessary. At present DCF (North) and DCF (South) are supervising enumeration by subcommittees. It was decided that a proposal may be submitted to the Government to make DCF (North)/ (South) as common Chairman of the subcommittees under their jurisdiction for their closer involvement.

(Action: DCF (Working Plan))

AC (N

AC (S)

DIR DSLR) DIR (AGRI

12.4.3 There are instances where different methodology was followed by the sub committees in carrying out 100 percent field enumeration. The same has been brought to the knowledge of the concerned committees for rectification of errors. In order to have a uniform approach in field verification in such cases, the committee felt the necessity to develop a common protocol in consultation with sub committees. Member Secretary was asked to take necessary action to prepare common protocol in consultation with the sub committees.

(Action: DCF (Working Plan)

12.4.4 Further, Goa Foundation has filed one more Execution Application before Hon'ble NGT. Therefore, it was decided by the committee to submit the 3rd Interim Report to the Government put on record the progress achieved by the review committee as on date in reviewing the areas provisionally identified by Thomas and Araujo committees.

(Action: DCF (Working Plan)

Based on the analysis, the status report on the progress achieved in review of private forest areas as on date is shown as under:

Division	Status of review after completion of filed enumeration							
	Total area enumerated	Area qualified in field survey	Plan completed					
North	1831 ha	558.66 ha*	347.22 ha*					
South	3390 ha	838.00 ha*	117.00 ha*					
Total	5221 ha	1396.66 ha*	464.22 ha*					

^{*}Final status to be determined after hearing of the objectors/representations and total enumeration, if decided

ACF (N) ACF(S)

AC (N) AC (S)

DIR (DSLR) DIR (AGRI)

Defiver cor

CUMULATIVE PROGRESS AS ON DATE

Cumulative progress achieved in survey and demarcation of Private Forest Areas as on 17.08.2021 is given below:

	Total number of Sy. Nos finalized by review committee	Qualifyin g Sy. Nos	Non qualifying Sy. Nos	Repeated/ Adjoining Sy Nos & Govt. Forests	
1st Interim Report	858	10	750	98	
2 nd Interim Report	1236	15	1101	120	
At present as on 17.08.2021	1306	24	1162	120	

Meeting ended with the vote of thanks to the chair.

(Anisha Kalkoor M., IFS)
Dy. Conservator of Forests,
Working Plan Division &
Member Secretary
Panaji-Goa.

No: MS/REV-PF/DCF/WP/2020-21/

Date:

/09/2021

To,

- 1. The Chief Conservator of Forests, Goa Van Bhavan, Panaji, Goa.
- 2. The Director Settlement & Land Records Panaji, Goa.
- 3. The Director of Agriculture Panaji, Goa.
- 4. The Dy Conservator of Forests Head Quarter Goa Van Bhavan, Panaji, Goa.
- 5. DCF (North)/DCF (South)
- 6. The Additional Collector North, Revenue Department, Margao, South.
- 7. The Additional Collector South, Revenue Department, Panaji, North.
- 8. The Asst. conservator of Forests Headquarter (North), Ponda, Goa.
- 9. The Asst. conservator of Forests Headquarter (South), Margao, Goa.

10. Office copy.

ACF (N) ACF(S) AC (

AC (S)

DIR (DSLR) DIR (

Annx-I

Detailed findings of the Review Committee after field verification for the areas fulfilling 40% canopy density & 5 Ha area as per Forest Cover Map of Forest Survey of India.

	Detaile
	ed findings of
Forest Survey of India.	Detailed findings of the Review Committee after field verification for the areas fulfilling 40% canopy density & 5 Ha area as per Forest Cover Map of
	st Cover Map of

		1		
4	ω	2	-	Sr.No
			Salcete	Sr.No Taluka
	Verna		Raia	Village
152	151	261	240(P)	Survey number Identified by the North Goa & South Goa SLEC
Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Survey number fulfilling 40% canopy density & 5Ha area as per forest cover map 2014-15 LISS IV of Forest Survey of India
35	35	33	33	Map Sheet Number
0.04	1.62	0.01	5.44	Area of patch as per LISS IV satellite image ha (Approx.)
Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Canopy Density > 40%
Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Patch more than 5 Ha
No	No	No	No	Whether Contiguous to Govt. Forests / Earlier identified forest
0	0	0	0	EXTENT OF AREA QUALIFY ING AS PRIVATE FOREST (HA)
The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	Decision of Review Committee after analysis based on LISS IV FCM 2014-15 (FSI), Google Timeline change corroborated by LISS III FCM 2012-13, public hearing, review of objection, Division offence case, Tree Felling, FCA & Court order etc., if any)

CF (N)

AC (N)

DIR AGRI)

	T		T	_	1	Т —	1	
13	12	=	10	9	∞	7	6	5
			Quepem					
	Morprila		Cusmune					Nuvem
33(P)	22(P)	54(P)	53(P)	227	228	234	245	251
Yes								
29	29	28	28	42	42	42	42	35
3.31	2.2	0.01	5.1	0.01	0.01	0.06	0.14	6.36
Yes								
Yes								
No								
0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest

ACF (N) ACF(S) AC (N)

AC (S)

DSLE DIR

HAGEN DO

DCF (WP)

CCF

	-	_						
22	21	20	19	18	17	16	15	14
			Cacora	Odar	Deao		Xelvona	
51(P)	46(P)	45(P)	165(P)	35(P)	105(P)	49(P)	29(P)	11(P)
Yes								
137	137	137	130	110	106	55	55	100
1.04	10.22	5.61	0.08	0.16	0.83	2.82	4.01	100 0.01
Yes								
Yes								
No								
0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest

AC (N)

	T	1	1	T			Т	T	Г	T
33	32	31	30	29	28	27	26	25	24	23
			Sulcorna							
36(P)	29(P)	21(P)	18(P)	72(P)	70(P)	67(P)	63(P)	61(P)	55(P)	53(P)
Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
136	136	136	136	137	137	137	137	137	137	137
14.96	6.75	2.89	13.93	0.32	0.44	1.5	1.48	1.936	3.64	4.33
Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
No	No	No	Yes	No						
4.0634	7.29	3.61	14.3412	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Part area is identified as private forests	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest			

AC (N)

DIR (AGRI) DCF (WP) CCF

44	43	42	41	40	39	38	37	36	35	34
					Mormugao			Dharbandora		
					Dabolim			Pilliem		
29	24	42/7-C-1	42/7-C	42/7-A	42	16	15	7	40(P)	37(P)
No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
•	•	,		,		38	38	38	136	136
	•	1	1	ï	i	19.62	18.64	8.26	4.2	4.7
		•	,			Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
1			,			Yes Yes	Yes Yes	Yes Yes	Yes Yes	Yes Yes
	•		,			Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

CF (N) AC (N)

	I				<u> </u>	I	
52	51	50	49	48	47	46	45
							=
					Sanco		
					ale		
219	216	214	199/6	199/5	199/1	21	28
No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
•	,						•
	'			•	,	•	•
ı							
1						1	. 1
No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
	•	•		•		•	•
The a	The a	The a	The a	The a	The a	The a	the co
rea doc riteria t	rea doc criteria t	rea doc oriteria t	rea doc criteria t	rea doc criteria t	rea doc criteria t	rea doc criteria t	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest
es not of	es not of	es not of	es not of	es not of	es not of	es not of	of
qualify Private	qualify Private	qualify Private	qualify Private	qualify Private	qualify Private	qualify Private	quainy Private
	219 No	216 No No - No - No - No - No - No - N	214 No No - No - No - No - No - No - N	199/6 No No - No - No - No - No - No -	199/5 No No - No - No - 199/6 No No - No - No - No - No - No -	Sancoale 199/1 No - - - - No - No - 199/5 199/6 No - - - - - No - 199/6 No - - - - - - No - 199/6 No - - - - - - No - 199/6 No - - - - - - No - 214 No - - - - - No - No 216 No - - - - No - No 219 No - - - - No -	21

ACF (N)

AC (N)

62	61	60	59	58	57	56	55	54
225	205	113	200	194	124	114	224	218
No								
•	1			1		1		
,		ı	ï				1	1
				•	•		,	
	ī	ı	ı	ı	ı	,	1	1
No								
•						ī		ı
The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest

AGF (N) ACF

AC (N)

AC (S)

DIR DSLA

DIR (AGI

RI) DCF (WF

OF (WP) CCF

ě

		T	T						
	70	69	68	67	66	65	64	63	
	1111						2		
	278	285/6	277	258	213/2	213/1	223/2-A	223/1	
	No								
			1						IVIAP OF FUE
156.686	,	1	,	ı	1		1		ivial of rorest survey of India.
			1	ı		1	1	1	ingia.
		1				1		1	
	No								
76.9383		1	r	MIN.					
*	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	The area does not qualify the criteria of Private Forest	

AC (N)