Proceedings of the Hearing conducted on 22.11.2023 at 10.30 a.m. in connection with objections filed by Land Owners / Power of Attorney / representatives of areas provisionally identified as Private Forests by North Goa (Thomas) and South Goa (Araujo) Committee in Curti village of Ponda Taluka, Salvador Do Mundo village of Bardez Taluka and Sancoale village of Mormugao Taluka.

The following members/representatives were present: -

- Shri Praveen Kumar Raghaw, IFS
   Chief Conservator of Forests & Chairman of Review Committee.
- Shri Naveen Kumar P, IFS
   Dy. Conservator of Forests (WP) & Member Secretary, Review Committee.
- Shri Shiv Prasad Naik,
   Representative of Additional Collector, North Goa District.
- Smt. Snehal S. Prabhu
   Representative of Additional Collector, South Goa District.
- Shri Audhut Sawant,
   Representative of the Director of Agriculture
- Shri Sameer S. Kamble,
   Representative of the Director of Settlement and Land Record, Panaji,
   Goa.
- Shri Deepak Pedneker,
   Assistant Conservator of Forests (North), Member.
- Shri D. M. Kudalkar,
   Assistant Conservator of Forests (South), Member.

## Following were in attendance

- 1. Shri, Mangaldas P. Devsekar, Range Forest Officer, Panaji Range
- Shri Deepak Tandel, Range Forest Officer, Ponda
- Shri Deepak Mahale, Range Forest Officer, Curdi
- Mohamed Teshad, Field Surveyor, DSLR
- 5. Promod Naik, Field Surveyor, DSLR
- Pravin KurtiKar, Field Surveyor, DSLR
- 7. Shri Gaurish Naik, Forest Surveyor (WP)

ACF (N) ACF(S) AC (N)

ACIS) DIR (DSLR)

DIR (AGRI)

DCE PWH COP

- Shri Arjun Gawas, Round Forester, Ponda Range
- 9. Shri Promod Malik, Forest Guard, Ponda Range.
- Shri Deepak P. Gaonkar, Forest Guard, Curdi Range.

Objection from the villagers of Curti village of Ponda Taluka, Salvador Do Mundo village of Bardez Taluka and Sancoale village of Mormugao Taluka were heard individually. It was informed to the Review Committee that the notice for hearing dated 20/11/23 was served to each objector through post, special messenger, also through telephone calls and messages.

The public hearing scheduled for the day is being conducted for the areas qualifying as private forests based on approved methodology. Survey number finalized by Thomas committee and Araujo Committee were enumerated on field by Sub Committee. Plan and enumeration report submitted by the sub-committee, is placed before the Review Committee for public hearing on 22/11/2023.

The area qualified as private forest after field enumeration is verified in presence of the objector. Field report along with copy of each such document / plan were shown to concerned objector during hearing.

Summary of hearing is as under:

Sr. No.	Name of the	Area	Objections query/ statements of the Owners/objectors	Observations/ comments of review committee
1.	Mr. Vishwesh	Survey no.	Objector was absent	Survey no. 79/1(P) .
	S. Sanzgiri	79/1,	for the hearing.	Sancoale village of
		Sancoale		Mormugao taluka was
		village of		identified as private forest
		Mormugao		by Araujo Committee.
		taluka.		Survey number 79/1 of
				Sancoale village of
				Mormugao taluka found
^				partly qualifying the criteria of private forest.

ACF(N) ACF(S) AC (N

ACIS DIR (DSLRI

DIR (AGRIJ

CCF

-				
				Smt. Necta Sanzgiri Wife of the objector via email has informed that the objector had expired and she is withdrawing the objection filed by her late husband.  Request has been taken on recorded by the committee.
2	No. leading	S	Objector use obsert	Survey Number 72(P) and
2.	Mr. Justino	Survey no.	Objector was absent for the hearing.	79/(P) of Sancoale village
	Agnel Quadros	72/6, 79/3, &	to the nearing.	of Mormugao taluka were
	Quadros	79/6 of		identified as private forest
		Sancoale		by Araujo Committee.
		village of		White review, Survey
		Mormugao		number 72/6, 79/3, &
		taluka		79/6 of Sancoale village of
				Mormugao taluka is
				found partly qualifying
				the criteria of private
				forest.
				The objector has given
				second chance for the
				hearing. Objector has
				received the posted letter,
				but not answering the call.
				Committee felt that
				adequate opportunity has

CF (N) ACF(S) AC (N) ASIS) DIR (DSLR) DIR (AGRI) DOF OWN

				been given to the objector
				to get him heard
				personally. Therefore,
				considering the timeline
				of Hon'ble NGT, his case is
				heard exparte.
3.	Mr. Oscar	Survey No.	Has objected for	Survey Number 59(P) of
	Jose Ferrao	59/0 of	identification of the	Curti village of Ponda
	Alias Toscar	Curti	property as private	Taluka was identified as
	Jose Ferrao &	Village of	forest.	private forest by Thomas
	Mr. Jinbirth	Ponda		Committee.
	Ferrao	Taluke		While review, Survey
				number 59/0 of Cu
				village of Ponda taluka
				found partly qualifying
				the criteria of private
				forest.
				The objector has signed
				the attendance sheet.
				Comments/Views/objecti
				on were recorded by the
				committee.
4.	Mr. Anthony	Survey No.	Objector was absent	Survey Number 59(P) of
	Wolfango	59/0 of	for the hearing.	Curti village of Ponda
	Ferrao	Curti		Taluka was identified as
		Village of		private forest by Thomas
		Ponda		Committee.
		Taluka		While review, Survey
				number 59/0 of Curti
				village of Ponda taluka
				found partly qualifying

ACF (N)

AC (N) AC(S) DIR (DSLR) DIR (AGRI) D

				the criteria of private forest.
				The notice has been
				delivered by post and
				cannot be contacted on
				mobile as not reachable.
				Considering the timeline
				of Hon'ble NGT,
				Committee decided to
				hear the case exparte.
				Comments/Views/objecti
				on were recorded by the
				committee.
5.	George	Survey No.	Representative	Survey Number 58(P) and
	Viegas	58/0 and	objected for	59(P) of Curti village of
	represented	59/0 of	identification of his	Ponda Taluka were
	by Kedar Naik	Curti	property as private	identified as private forest
		Village of	forest.	by Thomas Committee.
		Ponda		While review, Survey
		Taluka		number 58 and 59 of
				Curti village of Ponda
				taluka found partly
				qualifying the criteria of
				private forest.
				The representative of
				objector has signed the
				attendance sheet with
				objection.
				Comments/Views/objecti

ACFIS) AC IN ACIS DIR (DSLR) DIR (AGRI)

					on were recorded by the
	-				committee.
6.	Mr. Glenn	Survey	No.	He objected for	Survey Number 58(P) and
	Viegas also	58/0	and	identification as	59(P) of Curti village of
	represented	59/0	of	private forest.	Ponda Taluka were
	by Kedar Naik	Curti			identified as private forest
		Village	αf		by Thomas Committee.
		Ponda			Survey number 58 and
		Taluka			59 of Cuti village of Ponda
					taluka are found partly
					qualifying the criteria of
					private forest.
					The objector has been
					heard through video
					conference and filed his
					objection through email.
					Comments/Views/objecti
					on were recorded by the
					committee.
7.	Mr. Antonio	Survey	No.	Objector was absent	
	Wotfango	59/0	of	for the bearing.	Curti viltage of Ponda
	Simao Ferrao	Curti			Taluka was identified
		Village	of		private forest by Thomas
		Ponda			Committee.
		Taluka			While review, Survey
					number 59/0 of Curti
					village of Ponda taluka
					found partty qualifying
					the criteria of private
					forest.

ACP(S) AC (N) AC(S) DIR (DSLR) DIR (AGRI) DCE (AP)

				The notice has been delivered by post and
				cannot be contacted on mobile as not reachable.
				Considering the timeline of Hon'ble NGT,
				of Hon'ble NGT, Committee decided to
		=		hear the case exparte.
				Comments/Views/objecti
				on were recorded by the
				committee.
8.	Mr. Cosar	Survey No.	Representative of	Survey Number 58(P) and
	Viegas was	58/0 and	objector, objected for	59(P) of Curti village of
	represented	59/0 of	identification as his	Ponda Taluka were
	by Kedar Naik	Curti	area private forest.	identified as private forest
		Village of		by Thomas Committee.
		Ponda		While review, Survey
		Taluka		number 58 and 59 of
				Curti village of Ponda
				teluka are found partly
				qualifying the criteria of
				private forest.
				The representative of
				objector has signed the
				attendance sheet with
				objection.
				Comments/Views/objecti
				on were recorded by the
				committee.
9.	Mr. Mark	Survey No.	Representative of	Survey Number 58(P) and
-3	Viegas was	58/0 and	objector, objected for	59(P) of Curti village of
1.		1		

ACF (N) ACF(S) AC NI AC(S) DIR (DSLR) DIR (AGRI) DELEMPT

represented	59/0 of	identification of his	Ponda Taluka werc
by Kedar Naik	Curti	arca as private	identified as private forest
	Village of	forest.	by Thomas Committee.
	Ponda		While review, Survey
	Taluka		number 58 and 59 of
			Curti village of Ponda
			taluka were found partly
			qualifying the criteria of
			private forest.
			The representative of
			objector has signed the
			attendance sheet with
			objection.
			Comments/Views/objecti
			on were recorded by the
			committee.
Mr. Collin	Survey No.	Representative of	Survey Number 58(P) and
Viegas was	58/0 end	objector, objected for	59(P) of Curti village of
represented	59/0 of	identification his	Ponda Taluka were
by Kedar Naik	Curti	property as private	identified as private forest
	Village of	forest.	by Thomas Committee.
	Ponda		While review, Survey
	Taluka		number 58 and 59 🦳
			Curti village of Ponda
			taluka are found partly
			qualifying the criteria of
			private forest.
			The representative of
			objector has signed the
			attendance sheet with
			objection.
	Mr. Collin Viegas was represented	by Kedar Naik Curti Village of Ponda Taluka  Mr. Collin Survey No. Viegas was 58/0 and represented 59/0 of by Kedar Naik Curti Village of Ponda	by Kedar Naik  Village of Forest.  Ponda Taluka  Mr. Collin Survey No. Representative of Viegas was 58/0 and objector, objected for represented 59/0 of identification his by Kedar Naik  Village of Forest.

AC(S) DIR (DSLR) DIR (AGRI) DEE (MP)

			Comments/Views/objecti on were recorded by the committee.
11.	Mr. Vinay Datta Gaude	63/0 of Curti	
			on were recorded by the committee.
12.	Mrs. Sushila Gurudas Gaonkar	Survey No. 63/0 of Curti Village of Ponda Taluka.	 Survey Number 63(P) of Curti village of Ponda Taluka was identified as private forest by Thomas Committee. While review, Survey number 63 of Curti village

Ad(S) DIR (DSLR) DIR (AGRI)

qualifying the
1 0
of private forest.
otice has been
l by post.
informed
ically that she
attend hearing.
ec felt that
opportunity has
en to the objector
her heard
ly & by
ing the timelia
le NGT, heard her
arte.
its/Views/objecti
recorded by the
ec.
number 63(P) of
illage of Ponda
was identified as
orest by Thomas
ee.
review, Survey
63 of Curti village
taluka is found
ualifying criteria
e forest.
ector has signed
idance sheet and
pted the findings
-

ACE IN ACE(S) AC IN

AC(8) DIR (DSLR)

DIR (AGRI)

DCE (WP)

CCF

	Vinu Vishnu				of Review Committee as
	Gaude				this part is not falling in the identified patch.
					Comments/Views/objecti
					on were recorded by the
					committee.
14.	Shri Mahesh	Survey	No.	Has no objection, as	Survey Number 63(P) of
	Surlakar	63/0		his property is falling	Curti village of Ponda
		Curti		outside the	Taluka was identified as
		Village	of	qualifying area as	private forest by Thomas
		Ponde		private forests.	Committee.
		Taluka			While review, Survey
					number 63(P) of Curti
					village of Ponda taluka is
					found partly qualifying
					criteria of private forest.
					The objector has signed
			c		the attendance sheet and
					has accepted the findings
					of Review Committee as
					his part is not falling in
					the identified patch.
					Comments/Views/objecti
					on were recorded by the
					committee.
15.	Mr. Vinod	_		Has no objection, as	
	Bandekar	63/0	σf		
	represented	Curti	. 6	outside the	Taluka was identified as
	by his wife,	Village	of	,	private forest by Thomas  Committee.
	Gauri Vinod	Ponda Taluka		private forests.	Committee.
	Bendekar	raitika			

ACF(8) AC (N) AO(S) DIR (DSLR) BIR (AGRI)

Ī						While review, Survey
						number 63 of Curti village
						of Ponda taluka is found
						partly qualifying criteria
						of private forest.
						The objector has signed
						the attendance sheet and
						has accepted the findings
						of Review Committee as
						his part is not falling in
						the identified patch.
						Comments/Views/objec*i
						on were recorded by the
						committee.
ł	16.	Mrs. Purva K.	Survey	No.	Has no objection, as	Survey Number 63(P) of
		Sahakari	63/0	of	the property is falling	Curti village of Ponda
		represented	Curti		outside the	Taluka was identified as
l		by Kaushal	Village	οÊ	qualifying area as	private forest by Thomas
ı		Bal Sahakari	Ponda		private forests.	Committee.
		and Bala A.	Taluka			While review, Survey
l		Sahakari				number 63 of Curti village
l						of Ponda taluka is found
ı						partly qualifying crite
l						of private forest.
						The objector has signed
				1		the attendance sheet and
						has accepted the findings
						of Review Committee as
						his part is not falling in
						the identified patch.

ACF (N) ACP(S) AC N) AC(S) DIR (DSLR) DIR (AGRI) DCF

				Comments/Views/objecti
				on were recorded by the
				committee.
17	Mrs. Shelita	Survey No.	Objected for	Survey Number 107/7 of
- 13	Mascarenhas		identifying her area	Salvador Do Mundo
	madear cirria.	Salvador	as private forest.	village of Bardez Taluka
		Do Mundo		was identified as private
		village of		forest by Thomas
		Bardez		Committee.
		taltika		While review, Survey
				number 107/7 of
				Salvador Do Mundo
				village of Bardez taluke is
				found partly qualifying
				criteria of private forest.
				The objector has signed
				the attendance sheet with
				objection.
				1.4
				Comments/Views/objecti
				on were recorded by the
				committee.
18.	Dr.	Survey No.	Objected for	Survey Number 107/6(P),
	Mecnakshi	107/6,	identification of her	108(P) and 135/9(P) of
	Martins	108/0(P),	area es private	Salvador Do Mundo
	Shukla and	135/1,	forest.	village of Bardez Taluka
	other	135/9 of		were identified as private
		Salvador		forest by Thomas
		Do Mundo		Committee.
		Village of		While review, Survey
		Bardez		number 107/6, 108/0(P),
		Taluka		135/9(P) are found partly
	1	//		

AC IN ACIS DIR (DSLR) DIR (AGRI) DOE (WP)

				qualify and Survey
				number 135/1 village of
				Bardez Taluka fully
				qualifying criteria of
				private forest.
				The objector has signed
				the attendance sheet with
				objection
				Comments/Views/objecti
				on were recorded by the
				committee.
19.	Mr. Frederick	Survey No.	Objector was absent	Survey Number 107/4
	Vølente	107/4(P) of	for the Hearing.	Salvador Do Mundo
	Saldanha	Salvador		village of Bardez Taluka
		Do Mundo		was identified as private
		Village of		forest by Thomas
		Bardez		Committee.
		Taluka		While review, Survey
				number 107/4 of
				Selvador Do Mundo
				village of Bardez taluka is
				found partly qualifying
				the criteria of prive
				forest.
				Has failed to appear
				hefore committee multiple
				times. Objector is not
				answering the call after
				multiple attempts. Notice
				through post cannot be
				delivered as "addressee
	L.			

Ad (N) ACFISI ACF (N)

DIR (DSLR) DIR (AGRI) DCD (VP)

-				not found and intimation
				sent".
				Committee, felt sufficient
				opportunity has been
				given to hear him
	_			personally. Due to his
				absence, considering the
				timeline of Honble NGT,
				heard the case exparte.
				Comments/Views/objecti
				on were recorded by the
				committee.
20.	Mr. Aniceto	Survey No.	Objected for	Survey Number 107/9
	Manuel	107/9 and	identifying his area	and 108(P) of Salvador Do
	Martins	108(P) of	as private forest.	Mundo village of Bardez
		Selvador		Taluka were identified as
		Do Mundo		private forest by Thomas
		village of		Committee.
		Bardez		While review, Survey
		taluka		number 107/9 and 108 of
				Salvador Do Mundo
				village of Bardez taluka
				are found partly
				qualifying criteria of
				private forest.
				The objector has signed
				the attendance sheet
				Comments/Views/objecti
				on were recorded by the
				committee.

CF (N) ACF(S) AC (N) AC(S) DIR (DSLR) DIR (AGRI) DOP (MP)

DCPTMP) CCM

21.	Mr. Vishnu	Survey No.	·	Survey Number 107/9
	Mahadev	107/9 and	identifying his area	and 108(P) of Salvador Do
	Shirodkar	108(P) of	as private forest.	Mundo village of Bardez
	and other	Salvador		Taluka were identified as
		Do mundo		private forest by Thomas
		Village of		Committee.
		Bardez		While review, Survey
		Taluka		number 107/9 and 108 of
				Salvador Do Mundo
				village of Bardez taluka
				are found partly
				qualifying criteria of
				private forest.
				The objector has signed
				the attendance sheet
				Comments/Views/objecti
				on were recorded by the
				committee.
22.	Mrs. Maria	Survey No.	Objector was not	Survey Number 135/10 of
	Angelica	135/10 of	present for the	Salvador Do Mundo
	Cordeiro and	Salvador	hearing.	village of Bardez Taluka
	one other.	Do Mundo		was identified as private
		village of		forest by Thom
		Bardez		Committee.
		Taluka		While review, Survey
				number 135/10 of
				Salvador Do Mundo
				village of Bardez taluka is
				found partly qualifying
				the criteria of private
				forest.

AG (N) ACIS DIR (DSLR) DIR (AGRI) DCE (MIT)

*						
						Objector informed that
						she is not able to come as
						she Hospitalized and
						requested for next date.
						Considering the timeline
						of Hon'ble NGT, case is
						heard exparts.
						Comments/Views/objecti
						on were recorded by the
						committee.
23.	Mr. Francis	Survey No.	Objector	was	not	Survey Number 135/13 of
	Fernando	135/13 of	present	for	the	Salvador Do Mundo
	Martins	Salvador	hearing.			village of Bardez Taluka
	others	Do Mundo				was identified as private
		village of				forest by Thomas
		Bardez				Committee.
		Taluka				While review, Survey
						number 135/13 of
						Salvador Do Mundo
						village of Bardez taluka is
						found partly qualifying
						criteria of private forest.
						Objector has received the
						postal letter and informed
						that he will not able to
						come.
						Committee, felt sufficient
						opportunity has been
						given to hear him
						personally. Due to his
						absence, by considering
1	-	0.1				

ACF (N)

ACF(S)

AC (N)

CISI DIR (DSLR)

DIR (AGRI)

DCETMET

COR

				the timeline of Hon'ble
				NGT, heard the case
				exparte.
				Comments/Views/objecti
				on were recorded by the
				committee.
24.	Mr. Bismark	Survey No.	Objected for	Survey Number 135 of
	Facho and 4	135 of	identifying his	Salvador Do Mundo
	others	Salvador	property as private	village of Bardez Taluka
		Do Mundo	forest, as fruit	was identified as private
		village of	bearing trees exist in	forest by Thomas
		Bardez	the property.	Committee.
		Taluka		While review, Survey
				number 135 of Salvador
				Do Mundo village of
				Bardez taluka found
				partly qualifying criteria
				of private forest.
				The objector has signed
				the attendance sheet with
				objection.
				Comments/Views/objecti
				on were recorded by t.
				committee.
25.	Mrs. Denisc	Survey No.	Objector was not	Survey Number 135/10 of
	Paes DeSouza	135/10 of	present for the	Salvador Do Mundo
	and Lother	Salvador	hearing	village of Bardez Taluka
		Do Mundo		was identified as private
		Village of		forest by Thomas
		Bardez		Committee.

ACF (N) ACF(S) AC IVI ACISI DIR IDSLRI DIR (AGRIJ DEFENT COF

				While review, Survey
				number 135/10 of
				Salvador Do Mundo
				village of Bardez taluka is
				found partly qualifying
				criteria of private forest.
				Objector has received the
				postal letter and informed
				that he will not able to
				come.
				Committee, felt sufficient
				opportunity has been
				given to hear her
				personally due to her
				absence, considering the
				timeline of Hon'ble NGT,
				case is heard exparte.
				Comments/Views/objecti
				on were recorded by the
				committee.
26.	Mr. Doris B	Survey No.	Objected for	Survey Number 151(P) of
	Facho and 9	151 of	identifying his	Salvador Do Mundo
	others	Salvador	property as private	Village of Bardez Taluka
		Do Mundo	forest as area is a	was identified as private
		Village of	teak plantation	forest by Thomas
		Bardez		Committee.
		Taluka		While review, Survey
				number 151 of Salvador
				Do Mundo Village of
				Bardez taluka found

ACF (N) ACF(S) AC (N) ACIS DIR (DSLR) DIR (AGRI) DEF (W)

					partly qualifying criteria
					of private forest.
					The objector has signed
					the attendance sheet and
					with objection.
					Comments/Views/objecti
					on were recorded by the
					committee.
27.	Mr. Claudia	Survey No.	Objected	for	Survey Number
	Marques,	151/16 of	identifying	his	151/16(P) of Salvador Do
		Salvador	property as	private	Mundo Village of Bardez
		Do Mundo	forest.		Taluka was identified 🙈
		Village of			private forest by Thomas
		Bardez			Committee.
		Taluke			While review, Survey
					number I51/16 of
					Salvador Do Mundo
					Village of Bardez Taluka
					found partly qualifying
					the criteria of private
					forest.
					The objector has signed
					the attendance sheet
					Comments/Vicws/objecti
					on were recorded by the
					committee.
28.	Mrs.	Survey No.	Objected	for	Survey Number
	Lourdina	151/17 of	identification	her	151/17(P) of Salvador Do
	Martins	Salvador	property as	private	Mundo Village of Bardez
	represented	Do Mundo	forest.		
_					

ACF (NI ACFIS) AC NI ACISI DIR IDSLR) DIR (AGRI) DORINDI

CCF

				# 1 1 : 4 : G 1
	by Claudia	Village of		Taluka was identified as
	Marques	Bardez		private forest by Thomas
		Taluka		Committee.
				While review, Survey
				number 151/17 of
				Salvador Do Mundo
				Village of Bardez Teluka
				found partly qualifying
				criteria of private forest.
				The objector has signed
				the attendance sheet.
				Comments/Views/objecti
				on were recorded by the
				committee.
29.	Mr. Elivno	Survey No.	Objected for	Survey Number 151(P) of
	Jose do	151/10,	identification of his	Salvador Do Mundo
	Livramento	151/18,	area as private forest	Village of Bardez Taluka
	Martins	151/21, of	as it was plantation.	was identified as private
		Salvador		forest by Thomas
		Do Mundo		Committee.
	7 9	Village of		While review, Survey
		Bardez		number 151/10 and
		Taluka		151/18 of Salvador Do
	×-			Mundo Village of Bardez
				taluka are found to be not
				qualifying the criteria of
				private forest. Whereas,
				Survey number 151/21 of
				Salvador Do Mundo
				Village of Bardez taluka
			4,	found partly qualifying

ACF (N) ACF(S) AC (I

ACIS DIR (DSLR)

DER (AGRI)

CET COL

the criteria of private forest.
The objector has signed the attendance sheet with objection.  Comments/Views/objection were recorded by the committee.

Copies of photographs and attendance sheet of the Public Hearing arc enclosed as a part of the hearing proceedings.

The public hearing ended with thanks to chair.

ACF (HQ) (North) Member

ACF (HQ) (South) Member

Member

Rep of Director of Agriculture Rep. of Director of Settlement & Land Record Member

Representative of Additional Collector North (Revenue), Member

Representative of Additional Collector South (Revenue), Member

Dy. Conservator of Fare (Working Plan), Member Secretary

Chief Conservator of Forests Chairman.

## Copy to: -

- 1. Deputy Conservator of Forests (North /South) for information and necessary action.
- 2. Deputy Conservator of Forests (Headquarter) for information.
- 3. Member Secretary (Sub-Committees) for information and necessary action as directed by the review committee.

No: MS/REV-PF/Proc/2023-24/வுபு

Date: 20/11/2023

AC (N)

DIR (DSLR)

DIR (AGRI)

